

Brigitte Schultze\*

# Textual and pictorial components in the focus: paratext in translated graphic novels

<https://doi.org/10.1515/slav-2018-0039>

**Summary:** In spite of manifold textual-pictorial make-up and remarkably varied meaning making function, paratext is one of the neglected research topics around graphic novels (graphic narrative in general). Even more so, this goes for translated graphic novels. Distinguishing between carrier media of paratext (front and back covers, blurbs) and forms of information (introduction, imprint, appendix), this study starts from describing most characteristic components of graphic novels' paratext. Different from many articles on graphic narrative, this contribution is not only based on English, French and German, but also on Slavic (Czech, Polish, Serbian) source and target texts. All source texts are internationally respected, prize-winning examples of the genre. Comparative analysis profits from this enlargement of research material: it yields new insight into meaning making contained in or connected with paratext – including target recipients' privileged position.

**Keywords:** graphic novel, textual/pictorial paratext, intratext, paratext in translation, Czech and Polish graphic novels of the 21st century, Slavic source and target texts

## 1 Introduction

Paratext understood as a set of textual and pictorial components in graphic novels, from book cover to book cover, i.e. outside of the main text (Meyer 2013: 272, 276 passim; Schultze 2017b: 198)<sup>1</sup> is still among the insufficiently investigated

---

<sup>1</sup> Gerard Genette's – devoted solely to textual-literary tradition – classic *Paratexts* (2001) cannot be made applicable to research on multimedial, “multimodal”, respectively (Kaindl 2015: 33, 35–38), narrative. To bring to mind but one reason: “mediation” for the reader from outside the book

---

\*Corresponding author: Professor Dr. Brigitte Schultze, Johannes Gutenberg Universität Mainz, Institut für Slavistik, Turkologie und zirkumbaltische Studien, Abteilung Slavistik, Jakob-Welder Weg 18, 55128 Mainz, E-Mail: schultze@uni-mainz.de

topics of graphic narrative. Even more so, this goes for paratext in translated graphic novels.<sup>2</sup> Especially since the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, scholars now and then stress the meaning making function of paratext in graphic novels, comics, respectively (Meyer 2013: 278). However, the remarkable amount of components going into graphic novel paratext, i.e. both textual and pictorial elements, have not yet been recorded fairly comprehensively. Little is known about intratext as poetic device holding together paratext and main text.

Among the most circumspective compilations of textual components of paratext are some passages contained in Christine Meyer's essay *Un/Taming the Beast, or Graphic Novels (Re)Considered*. Meyer (2013: 272, 276, 283 passim) points at "prefaces, acknowledgments, introductions, appendices", "publisher and artist (s) information", "story and plot cues", "cover pages", "promotional praise", "dust jackets", "inside title pages" and further detail. Here, similarly as in other discussions of paratext, the carrier media of paratext information, i.e. front and back covers, title pages, blurbs etc., are not distinguished from the textual forms offering verbal contents, e.g., introduction, title, dedication and other items (cf. Schultze 2017a: 49). With respect to translations, Björn Laser and Michael Groenewald (2015: 237) estimate the probability of translational transfer of paratext ("Übersetzungswahrscheinlichkeit") in this way: "Paratexts like prefaces, pseudoprefaces or glossaries, provided that they are relevant for narration and communication, are also translated." Pictorial material on title pages or back covers is most frequently ignored in discussion of paratext.

It is important to note most scholarly contributions concerning paratext are based on English (American) graphic narratives.<sup>3</sup> So far, paratext in Slavic graphic novels or in graphic novels translated into one or the other Slavic language seems to have escaped international experts. This study, then, will try to integrate Slavic source and target texts into comparative research and comparative translation studies. Journalistic articles concerning graphic novels from different countries sometimes welcome paratextual information in newly edited graphic novels as support for readers or miss pieces of paratext (footnotes, forewords) that might ascertain readers' meaning making.<sup>4</sup>

---

("epitext" in Genette's terminology, cf. Macksey 2001: XVIII) goes beyond the concept of paratext underlying this study (cf. Schultze 2017b: 198, note 6).

<sup>2</sup> We did not find any scholarly contribution dedicated to the topic chosen here.

<sup>3</sup> Some relevant contributions concerning paratext in Italian or Spanish graphic novels may have escaped our attention.

<sup>4</sup> Reviewing a recent German translation of Ed Piskor's comics devoted to Hip-Hop, Jens Christian Rabe (2016) regrets the edition (obviously in accordance with the American series) „goes without footnotes as well as a subject or name index“. – Several presentations of outstanding graphic

Research on the topic “paratext”, no doubt, needs as varied textual material as possible. With respect to the anything but homogeneous make-up of this subset of graphic novels, one should start with considerations of some general kind. Next to the necessity of making a difference between carrier media (book cover, title page, blurbs) and textual-pictorial items communicating information and contents (title, motto, afterword), the often neglected contact zones between paratext and main text, e.g., ‘quotation’ of pictorial items of the main text on the title page, deserve specific attention. In view of the widely used term “meaning making”, a difference should be made between paratext clearly stemming from the author, a team of author and artist, respectively, and components of paratext contributed by a publisher (e.g., advertising material) or some expert invited to write an afterword. No doubt, experts other than the creators of the graphic novel may support readers’ understanding of the graphic narrative substantially. For the sake of transparency, such additional textual components of paratext – if necessary – will be evaluated outside of the meaning making process shaped by the author/ author and artist themselves. Experience shows, the responsibility for single pieces of paratext cannot always be ascertained. If relevant, cases of ambiguity should be noticed. Of course, a further reservation has to be made with respect to the general idea of meaning making through paratext. Paratext in graphic novels is remarkably poly-functional. Irrelevant for meaning making are, e.g., single components offering matter-of-fact information and advertising, unless such material functions meta-textually.

Comparative analysis of translated graphic novels from different countries shows many texts are only provided with limited paratext. Others, however, are equipped with enriched, even complex paratext. With respect to some graphic novels, the distinction between limited and enriched, more complex paratext may be supplemented by a further paradigm. Next to paratext with fairly balanced out relation between text-based and picture-based paratext, there is also paratextual material in which either verbal or pictorial components dominate. The boundaries between these variants of multimodal paratext are, of course, transitional, i.e. may be disputed. Translations may reduce, change or enlarge these textual-pictorial components.

Next to including Slavic graphic novels into comparative translation studies on multimodal texts, the main object of this article is a more comprehensive recording of the components and functions of paratext than translation studies

---

narratives in Paul Gravett’s classic *1001 comics you should read before life is over* (2012) make it a point adequate reception of particular texts asks for “instructions for readers”, i.e. some sort of paratext going with the edition of the graphic narrative (cf. Schultze 2017b: 194). – If not indicated otherwise, all translations into English are mine. B. S.

(research on graphic narrative anyhow) can dispose of till now. Based on a number of case studies concerned with Slavic and non-Slavic languages, the contribution of specific components of paratext to meaning making in graphic novels will be exemplified.<sup>5</sup> Comparative translation analysis of single textual-pictorial items can lead to hermeneutic gain. Since reviews of translated graphic novels seldom pay attention to translational achievement, it will be asked if translators make use of relevant information contained in paratext or not.<sup>6</sup>

The texts looked into here are single-book graphic novels, i.e. not series (serials).<sup>7</sup> The languages included, mostly as source and target texts, are English, French and German as non-Slavic languages and Czech, Polish and Serbian as Slavic languages. In the following, comparative analysis will be prepared by further preliminaries: a compilation of textual and pictorial items possibly going into paratext and a brief characterization of the corpus of texts. A difference will be made between graphic novels with a limited amount of paratext and graphic novels with rich and complex paratext (section 2). The sections 3–5 will be devoted to insight gained through comparative analysis. Summarizing (section 6), the intellectual and aesthetic contribution of paratext to meaning making in high quality graphic novels and their translations will be of specific interest. It is to be asked how the visibility of Slavic multimodal storytelling might be promoted in international research.

## 2 Further preliminaries: components of paratext, the corpus of source and target graphic novels

According to the choice of graphic novels looked into for this study (this goes beyond the amount of examples discussed in detail), the carrier media containing paratextual material are: front and back covers, front and back inner covers, dust

---

<sup>5</sup> I owe specific thanks to Beata Weinhagen and Jan Michalik who helped me in getting access to a number of source and target texts.

<sup>6</sup> In a number of cases, this research on paratext can rely on preceding comparative analysis of complete main texts.

<sup>7</sup> Christine Meyer's (2013: 273) enumeration of verbal components of paratext is mainly based on Mike Carey's and Peter Gross's graphic narrative *The Unwritten*, a text following "the logic of serial storytelling". A further variant of paratext not relevant for this study are insertions of "letter columns", i.e. paratextual discourse with readers in American comic series "in the late 1950s and 1960s" (Stein 2013: 167).

jackets, title pages, extra pages preceding or following the main text, even extra pages inserted into the main text.

Textual components of paratext mainly are: title and subtitle, imprint, dedication, acknowledgements, introduction and/or foreword, afterword, appendix (containing bibliographical data, lists of different source texts etc.), glossary. Pictorial components are most likely to be found on front and back covers, inner book covers, title pages and additional pages preceding or following the main text. If there is a table of contents, pictorial elements will keep in mind multimodal storytelling. In translations, pictorial elements going with verbal information of paratext are often treated as invariants. However, there are exceptions to this tendency. Deviations have to be examined with respect to plausibility and informative and/or meaning making function. The same, of course, goes for deviations in textual material.

The corpus of texts comprises six case studies out of which two contain only a limited amount of paratext, four, however, offer enriched paratext and possibly specific challenge for translators. With respect to terminological classification by editors and reviewers, the texts are alternately called “graphic novel” or “comic” (cf. Schultze 2017a: 45). Since all case studies concern high-quality, award-winning graphic narratives, the term “graphic novel” seems to be most adequate. In accordance with actual research on multimodal prose, in the following, *graphic narrative* will be understood as *umbrella term* comprising graphic novel, comic(s), manga and further forms and subgenres of graphic storytelling (Stein & Thon 2013: 5; Schultze 2017b: 195).

The graphic novels with relatively limited paratext are the Polish album *Powstanie. 1. Za dzień, za dwa* (‘The Uprising. 1. For one day, for two’) by Krzysztof Gawronkiewicz and Marzena Sowa (2014),<sup>8</sup> and Markus Färber’s *Reprobis*, a German graphic novel based on legends of St. Christopher (2012). Representative for paratextual make-up in hosts of graphic novels of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, these case studies will be discussed with respect to their characteristic choice of textual and pictorial paratext (section 3).

Variants of enriched paratext are contained in Reinhard Kleist’s devoted to 20<sup>th</sup> century Jewish fate *Der Boxer* (2012), Jacques Tardi’s album *C’était la guerre des tranchées* (1993) and the Czech graphic novel *Alois Nebel* by Jaroslav Rudiš and Jaromír 99 (= Jaromír Švejdlík), which first appeared in book form in 2006. While Kleist’s *Der Boxer*, similarly as Färber’s *Reprobis*, is partly equipped with

---

<sup>8</sup> It is noteworthy, most editions place the author (texter) before the artist (painter). In this case, the artist is named first.

paratext not stemming from the author himself, the other graphic novels are cases of authorship applying to main text and paratext.

A different case of enlarged paratext is offered in Russ Kick's international project *The Graphic Canon. From the 'Epic of Gilgamesh' to Shakespeare to 'Dangerous Liaisons'* (2012). This anthology presents canonic literature from all over the world, partly as excerpts, partly as textual-pictorial adaptations of complete texts. Meant to spur readers' education (in German "Bildung") and induce readers to get acquainted with the 'originals', and be it in translations (Kick 2012: IX), ample forms of paratext (introductions, bibliographical material) belong to the project from the outset. With respect to the scope of *Graphic Canon*, only a choice of paratextual material in translational transfer will be discussed (section 5).

### 3 Variants of limited paratext

The Polish album *Powstanie. 1. Za dzień, za dwa* by Krzysztof Gawronkiewicz and Marzena Sowa may serve as an example of limited paratext. Devoted to glimpses of private life in occupied by German troops Warsaw between spring 1944 and the moment before the beginning of the uprising (August 1, 1944), the album only consists of a main text of 64 uncounted pages and paratext limited to front and back covers and two almost identical title pages. The title pages contain matter-of-fact information, reverse are data on previous works by Gawronkiewicz and Sowa, the imprint, respectively. Front and back covers evidently follow different reader-oriented strategies. While the picture-based front cover, first of all, sets the mind for imagining apocalyptic fate caused by Nazi Germany, the mainly text-based back cover appeals to readers' 'understanding' reception of the graphic novel's topic. The economic paratext is tangibly connected with the main text. The front cover shows a picture not contained in the main text. However, it seems to summarize sights of devastation contained in several pictures and panels of the main text. Dominated by shadows of dark grey ending in deep black, with but a small segment of light grey (milky white) in the upper right corner, the cover presents utterly destroyed multistory buildings of the city of Warsaw. The only verbal element is – authorized, as it were, by the "Reichsadler" – the information the building cannot be used any more: "EINGANG VERBOTEN" (No Entrance). At the right bottom of the cover, there is a small sign of human life: standing out from the dark background through light grey, there is a tiny group of two persons (male and female) holding one another tight. The pair may stand for the fate of the central pair of lovers in the main text, Alicja and Edward, but also for other persons longing for a peaceful common future – when terror is over.

The back cover, in contrast, shows Alicja's and Edward's worried faces in a single frame. Shortened by a speech bubble with Edward's words, the picture is taken from one of the first pages of the main text (Gawronkiewicz & Sowa 2014: [8]). Such pictorial intratext on back covers is typical of many graphic novels. Edward's words are spurred by his watching a German duty officer: "Suffices to be a Pole to die" ("Wystarczy być Polakiem, żeby umrzeć"). Edward's remark concerns the occupying forces' contempt for the 'Slavic' Poles. Looking up the picture in the main text, readers may be introduced into fundamental aspects of the political and human-personal situation. On the whole, there is remarkable coherence between paratext and main text: Next to informing about the main pairs of lovers (Alicja's sister is going to get married), several short paragraphs on the back cover introduce into main contents of the graphic novel, inform about the historical situation in Warsaw, even beyond the beginning of the uprising. They likewise inform about the team of artist and author, their international renown as creators of graphic novels.

With respect to translational transfer, the paratext of *Powstanie* will not cause specific challenge for translators. While the pictorial elements can be retained, i.e. treated as invariants, the verbal components on the back cover just invite to close to the source text transfer. The doubled title page is a case for translators and letterers. As the decisive word POWSTANIE is first expounded by grey letters, then literally moved back by white letters on yellow ground, this meaning making device should be followed. The juxtaposition of two titles in different colours, among others, makes recipients aware of history revived and history 'gone fade'.

In this case, the target text is the French translation *L'insurrection. 1. Avant l'orage*.<sup>9</sup> The meaning making device contained in the two title pages is reproduced (Gawronkiewicz & Sowa 2014: [1, 3]). The shade of the front cover is not quite as dark as in the source text, so the architecture of the devastated building is more discernible. There are clear differences on the back cover, both in verbal and pictorial detail.<sup>10</sup> The textual component starts with additional intratext – Alicja's recalling Edward's observations on her family: "In your family/one always came/ to forget about the war" ("Dans ta famille/on arrivait toujours/ à oublier la guerre." Gawronkiewicz & Sowa 2014: 20). Meaning making between main text and paratext is intensified. With respect to verbal information, two further paragraphs on the back cover resemble the source text. However, similarly

---

<sup>9</sup> The French edition does not name a translator. It can be assumed Marzena Sowa, possibly in cooperation with someone else, did the translating herself. This seems to be a specific case of synchronous translation.

<sup>10</sup> In the translated graphic novels looked into for this study, back covers are the component of paratext most likely to deviate from source texts' verbal and pictorial make-up.

the additional verbal items (altogether three quotations from Alicja's mind) strengthen the aspect of private life in *Powstanie*. The pictorial component, Edward's and Alicja's faces, is replaced with another picture from the main text. Recalling a day of collective enjoyment at the Vistula river (a moment of forgetting about the war), Edward tells Alicja: "You were/beaming/and/this very day,/I understood/that I love you" ("Tu étais/resplendissante/et, ce jour-la,/j'ai compris/que je t'aimais". Gawronkiewicz & Sowa 2014: 57). Edward's remark "Tu étais resplendissante" is an addition in the target text. According to Edward's remarkably reserved way of expressing himself, the source text is: "Tego dnia/zrozumiałem,/że jestem/w tobie/zakochany" (Gawronkiewicz & Sowa 2014: [57]). The deviations on the back cover and connected with the back cover may be a concession to target side recipients, i.e. their – assumed by the translator – preference for the layer of private life as 'counterweight' to the political topic on the back cover. Of course, on the whole, Polish and French readers get almost the same offer of meaning making through paratext.

Markus Färber's graphic novel *Reprobis* (2012, approximately 'the rejected', German 'der Zurückgewiesene')<sup>11</sup> is based on several written records of the legend of the Holy Christopher (Imprint-page [91]). Among the case studies discussed here, it stands out through the largest proportion of pictorial components, both in paratext and main text. In the main text, 87 uncounted pages, there are many pictures and panels without any verbal items. Main text and paratext are, among others, held together by a dense texture of highly abstract pictorial elements (pieces of landscape, figures, ciphers of flowing water etc.). The dominating colours are shades of grey, alternating with milky white and black. Equipped with shades of blue and brown, some components of paratext, i.e. front and back covers and blurbs on back of both cover pages, function as visual frame of the graphic novel. Except for front and back covers and blurbs, there are the following carrier media of paratext: front and back inner book covers, the title page, an "Afterword" ("Nachwort") by the art historian Cordula Patzig ([88–89]) and the imprint-page containing imprint, the above mentioned information on source material and a note of thanks. Three components of the paratext, i.e. information on the back cover, Cordula Patzig's "Afterword" and the inner book covers are evidently meant to prepare and support readers' meaning making process. On the back cover, *Reprobis* is introduced as a "huge creature", a "godless giant from the people of the dogheaded" [Kleist 2012: 16] in search of the "mightiest of all rulers", whom he wishes to serve. Cordula Patzig's "Afterword", a textual compo-

<sup>11</sup> Cordula Patzig (Färber 2012: [88]) gives the meanings "der Verworfenene" ('the depraved'), "der Schlechte" ('the bad', 'the evil').



ment from an outside expert, is the largest piece of coherent text in the publication. Suggesting repeated careful reading for the sake of finding out more about pictorial detail, Patzig informs about the legends and imagery of St. Christopher in art history. The most intense contact zone between paratext and main text is probably the back inner book cover. It shows the “lands” Reprobus wanders through and names the main stations of the search: “The Army” (“Das Heer”), “The Hermit” (“Der Eremit”) and others. The main text informs about Reprobus’ experience from station to station. The turning point is his encounter with Christ. The station is identified as “The Child” (“Das Kind”). Having recognized Christ by his “stigmata” and carried him (the “child”, respectively) across the river, Reprobus experiences his transformation into a human being. He is baptized and named “Christopher” (Färber 2012: [67–72]).

While the main text presents Reprobus’ route in a sequence of chapters, each with a ‘password’ and picture identifying every station (e.g., the Hermit is connected with a group of cactus-like trees), the inner book cover emphasizes the names of the stations. Here, then, a sort of table of contents is embedded into a painted map, landscape, respectively.<sup>12</sup>

Considering the dominance of pictorial components both in main text and paratext, it can be expected the pictorial components will be treated as invariants by translators. The Polish translation by Grzegorz Janusz, indeed, tells readers in the imprint the pictorial make-up of the source text is retained: “Rysunki i scenariusz [Drawings and scenery]: Markus Färber” (Färber & Janusz 2013: [91]). There is, however, an exception to identity of paratextual make-up. Similarly as in the French translation of *Powstanie*, deviation is apparent on the back cover. While the source text introduces Reprobus as entirely enigmatic figure, the target text supports readers with substantial information taken from Cordula Patzig’s “Afterword”.

Considering the extremely enigmatic beginning of Färber’s graphic novel, the deviation in the Polish target text seems fully plausible. Having read the concise information on the back cover, Polish recipients may start reading the multimodal

---

<sup>12</sup> Equipping inner book covers with the function of a table of contents is poetic device also used in Polish graphic novels. E.g., in Sylvain Savoia’s and Marzena Sowa’s (going back to a series) graphic novel *Marzi*, both inner book covers repeat pictorial items contained in the table of contents: In the first volume, presenting Marzi’s childhood memories in communist Poland till the beginning of *Solidarność*, 33 chapters (we are referring to the German translation appeared in 2012) are identified through headlines arousing readers’ curiosity (“Communism is no appetite suppressant”) and small pictorial items (in this case a carp) going with the headline. The inner book covers only repeat the identifying pictorial components. Readers can easily understand Marzi’s recollections concern private-personal and political life in Poland.

text – even without having taken note of Patzig’s article. In a way, in comparison to source text readers, target text readers appear to be in a privileged position.<sup>13</sup> As will be shown, next to deviations that may support readers’ meaning making process, the case studies concerning enriched paratext also contain deviations clearly detrimental to the meaning making conceived of in source text graphic novels.

## 4 Variants of enriched paratext

Based on historical and biographical source material and going back to the American novel *Harry Haft. Auschwitz Survivor, challenger of Rocky Marciano*<sup>14</sup> by the boxer’s son Alan Scott Haft, Reinhard Kleist’s graphic novel *Der Boxer. Die wahre Geschichte des Hertzko Haft* is equipped with ample paratextual material. Author and artist in one person, Kleist, among others, uses photography for the creation of his remarkably condensed pen-and-ink drawings (Knoben 2017).<sup>15</sup> These context given, pictorial (painted) items within paratext as Kleist’s contribution to meaning making have to be of specific concern.

The graphic novel presents the boxer’s life story in a kind of circle structure, starting and ending with Alan Scott Haft’s, the son’s, recollections of Harry Haft’s search for his first love, Leah, in Florida in 1963. The larger part of the main text renders the father’s recollections as they had been retold to his son: about life in Poland, survival in the ghetto as a boxer protected by an SS-officer, an intermediate stop as “displaced person” in Germany, arduous life as a boxer in the United States and the end of the boxing career (Schultze [2018]).

Next to larger main text (pp. 5–181) than in the previous examples, there is more extensive and varied paratext. Carrier media containing paratext are: front and back covers, front and back inner book covers, two pages with dedication and imprints, the title page, an appendix (unnamed) of 14 pages (pp. 184–198) containing verbal and visual components. The verbal and pictorial make-up of such

---

**13** Similarly, some readers of the French translation of *Marzi* (cf. note 12) appear as privileged readers. While Sylvain Savoia’s source text introduction to *Marzi* is contained in most translations, a limited French edition of the graphic novel (Éditions de la Gouttière) offers a remarkably personal introduction by Marzena Sowa herself (Bibliographie: KNV GmbH, 70565 Stuttgart). This personal account of childhood memories seems specifically helpful as access to the graphic novel.

**14** Reinhard Kleist uses the German translation appeared in Göttingen in 2009 (Imprint).

**15** In order to illustrate Kleist’s artistic device of repeated drawing of the same character, Martina Knoben (2017) quotes Kleist himself: “You internalize the figure and get a feeling of how he would speak and act.”

enriched paratext looks like this: The front cover shows a procession of prisoners, among them Harry Haft, walking up to the entrance of Auschwitz and, in the foreground, the boxer Harry Haft, utterly concentrated in a fight. The back cover contains a picture recalling Haft's boxing career in the United States and short information concerning boxing as Haft's chance of survival in the ghetto and Kleist's approach to this life story. The front and back inner book covers show a panoramic view of Auschwitz prisoners at the bottom of both pages. Next to title, subtitle and mention of the source text (the novel), the title page shows Harry Haft in the boxing ring – again with a face in utter concentration – his personal tag, as it were. Starting from a photograph presenting Haft as professional boxer, the appendix presents a detailed report on "Boxing in concentration camps" ("Boxen im KZ") by Martin Krauß (pp. 185–193). The reader learns more about the fate of Harry Haft, but also about a number of further boxers, i.e. fellow-sufferers with similar fate. Two of several inserted pen-and-ink drawings could easily be fitted into the main text. So there is a thematical and a pictorial link between paratext and main text. Four further pages are filled with Kleist's sketches. The last components of paratext are biographical data on Reinhard Kleist and a note of thanks illustrated with a further picture of the boxer Harry Haft 'in action'.

The remarkably rich paratext, then, consists of verbal material mainly contributed to the graphic novel by an outside expert and pictorial components created in Kleist's studio. While Krauß, a journalist and author (Kleist 2012: 193), first of all, supports readers' meaning making process (maybe, in second reading) through matter-of-fact information, i.e. puts them in a position of well-informedness, Kleist, by strengthening the pictorial layer of the graphic novel, enforces the offer of aesthetic (emotional) reception kept ready in the main text.

With respect to translational transfer, it is important to note translators are not confronted with linguistic challenge, e.g., language mix or hard to decipher abbreviations. Deviations from source side paratext may consist in incomplete transfer of paratextual material (cf. Laser's and Groenewald's statement concerning "Übersetzungswahrscheinlichkeit"), different arrangement of single components of paratext (e.g. pictures), deviations in details of lettering etc.

It is noticeable both translations looked into here, i.e. the Czech and the Serbian translation,<sup>16</sup> in principle following the rendition of the main text (Schultze [2018]), aim at careful and complete transfer of verbal and pictorial elements of the source text. However, and this goes especially for the Czech

---

<sup>16</sup> The possibility of a translation into Polish had been examined, however, dismissed on account of political considerations.

translation, they feel free to shift single verbal and pictorial items, even to add further detail to paratext.

Occurring in both translations shifting of single pictorial components within Krauß's article on "Boxing in concentration camps" is, of course, a matter of layout. Deviation from the source text takes place, when source side (German) text without illustration, i.e. matter-of-fact information on Reinhard Kleist and Alan Scott Haft (Kleist 2012: [199]), is equipped with pictorial items. In this case, so it seems, the Czech translation (Kleist & Pokorná 2015: [198]) adds one of Harry Haft's boxing rivals. The Serbian target text (Kleist & Popov 2016: [199], however, adds one of the pictures of Haft himself. To give another example, while the source text (Kleist 2012: [198]) and, following the source text, the Serbian translation (Kleist & Popov 2016: [200]), present the note of thanks illustrated with a fairly large picture of Harry Haft, the Czech translation (Kleist & Pokorná 2015: [199]) shows two different images of the boxer: with a face of stern decisiveness on the one hand and a face in utter strain and grimness on the other hand. This device of juxtaposition deviates from Kleist's and his team's (Krauß's) strategies in the paratextual make-up. The Czech translator, so it seems, deems paratext less compulsory than the main text. E.g., while the Serbian translator renders two short paragraphs with information for readers on the back cover in accordance with the main text, the Czech translation replaces both paragraphs by conventional advertising leading away from the momentous topic of the graphic novel: "A story of life and great love in the middle of the boxing ring" ("Příběh života a velké lásky uprostřed boxerského ringu"). However, this is important to note, the information contained on the source text book cover, even further detail, is given on both inner book covers. The inner book covers, this also goes for the Serbian translation, contain substantial information for target text readers. These inner book covers as well as the front cover and the title page are probably the components of paratext readers' reception starts from.

There are even further deviations in the Czech paratext possibly relevant for readers' reception and meaning making. Several white or grey pages of the source text are changed into black pages in the target text. E.g., the title page is rendered all black with title and subtitle in white letters. The same goes for the page containing the dedication. Of course, the meaning making 'frame' for the topic, the panoramic view of Auschwitz prisoners, is retained both in the Czech and the Serbian translations.

The amount of deviation observed in paratextual material of Kleist's graphic novel, no doubt, goes beyond deviation found in many other case studies.<sup>17</sup>

---

17 Different from other graphic novels looked into here, paratext in Kleist's *Der Boxer* does not contain any implicit instructions for translators. In the main text, however, there are meaning

In contrast to Kleist's graphic novel based on 'foreign' fate, Jacques Tardi's album *C'était la guerre des tranchées* ('Trench warfare') goes back to experience of the First World War in Tardi's own family. As will be shown, personal involvement is not only tangible in specific textual and pictorial components of paratext, but also in extremely dense connection between paratext and main text. Moreover, since 'Trench warfare' is conceived of as work-in-progress (Schultze 2017a: 54, notes 12, 13), enrichment of paratext also takes place from the first (1993) to the second (2014) edition: i.e., while the main text is identical in both publications, paratext undergoes further processing.

Since both editions of the German translation (Tardi & Hein 2002, 2013) are based on the 1993 version of the album, comparative analysis has to start from the initial make-up of paratext.

For Tardi, this graphic narrative is a means of handling trauma: the sight of his silently vegetating grandfather who had survived the First World War in a bomb crater (Andreas C. Knigge in Gravett 2012: 440) had come to haunt his memories. Presented in black and white with many shades of grey, the main text pulls readers into a type of revived memory: "the reader accompanies single soldiers for some time, through mud and filth and devastated landscapes, however, before he can really come close to them, a MG-salvo ends the acquaintance, and Tardi hands over to the next figure" (A. C. Knigge in Gravett 2012: 440).

A component of paratext, an introduction by the author himself (Tardi 1993: [5]), announces and sums up main contents. The essence of the soldiers' situation is, among others, phrased in this way:

Situations lived through by men manipulated and stuck in mud, apparently not satisfied with the place they are in, and having but one hope – to survive one more hour, hoping moreover to return to them... in one word, that war stops! There are no 'heroes', no 'main person' in this lamentable collective adventure, which is war: Nothing but a gigantic and anonymous scream in death throes.

The "death throes" ("cri d'agonie") appear as a pattern of onomatopoeia ("AAA") in the main text (Schultze [2018]).

---

making strategies which ought to be followed by translators. Meaning making is specifically entrusted to interjections and onomatopoeia. Except for the Jewish interjection *oi* (*oi, oi, oi*) which is retained throughout the main text, all interjections and onomatopoeia belong to Harry Haft's 'after-holocaust-language', i.e. English. Opting for acculturation as transfer concept, the Czech translator misses Kleist's poetic device. The Jewish interjection *oi*, becomes *ou* and English onomatopoeia are rendered as capitalized Czech interjections (Schultze [2018]). The Czech translator, then, deviates from meaning making offer and strategies both in paratext and main text.

Next to the page with the introduction, there are the following carrier media of paratext: front and back covers, title page, three further pages out of which one contains a note of thanks (“Remerciements” [7]) to an expert in matters of the First World War, two, however, are an uncounted – inserted into the main text [29–30] – narrative of the author himself (“Tardi”). Following the main text, there is an appendix listing films and literature (“filmographie”, “bibliographie”) which had inspired and supported the author in his work. In the inserted narrative, the transitional relation between paratext and main text is specifically apparent: Showing pictures of total destruction on top of both pages, the author tries to put himself into the situation of a soldier having to carry a soup to his comrades in the trenches. The author recalls his grandmother who had told him about the grandfather’s experience in war, reflects on mankind’s incapability of learning from human error.

Multimodality is not only realized through pictures in the inserted narrative, but also through pictorial items on front and back covers, the title page and the note of thanks. On the title page, the pictorial component is connected with a dedication bringing to mind Tardi’s personal involvement in ‘Trench warfare’. Next to informing about authorship (“Textes et dessins Tardi”) and title, the page contains a dedication to the author’s grandfather (“A mon grand-père”) and a reproduction of the grandfather’s medal (decoration) with blood flowing down behind the medal.

On the back cover, the medal is repeated as pictorial item, however, with meaningful changes. Instead of the white title page, the background is all black, and the medal is presented the other way around, i.e. the blood is flowing upward. The meaning making function of multimodal paratext in Tardi’s album could be discussed further.

The German translation done by Michael Hein as translator and Volker Hamann as handletterer, will only be looked into with respect to three components of paratext: the front and back covers, the title page and the appendix. On the whole a remarkably complete and precise in multimodal transfer translation (Schultze 2017a: 53; Schultze 2017b: 203), the target text contains several tangible deviations in these components of paratext.

It is noticeable, the covers of the first French edition (1993) and the German translation ‘Grabenkrieg’ (2013) are different.<sup>18</sup> Both covers show pictures not contained in the main text. However, in both cases, the covers present an apocalyptic end: The French album starts with the picture of two utterly ex-

---

<sup>18</sup> We did not have access to the first (2002) German translation. According to the imprint of the second edition, both publications are identical.

hausted, wounded soldiers carrying a dead or half-dead comrade; the cover of the German translation shows two soldiers in a trench, possibly dead since some time ago. The cover of the German text, then, illustrates the title ‘Grabenkrieg’.<sup>19</sup> The choice of a different book cover for the German translation seems plausible. After all, both the French and the German cover abound with visual markers of a world taken to pieces. The meaning making impulse is quite similar.

Substantial deviation is apparent on the title page of the German translation. It touches upon Tardi’s personal involvement in the topic of the album. The pictorial item, the medal, is replaced by a picture taken from the main text – a rat approaching a corpse in the trench (Tardi & Hein 2013: 20). Correspondingly, the medal is omitted on the back cover. Instead, the back cover quotes some lines taken from the introduction. The verbal component of the dedication – “Meinem Großvater gewidmet” – is rendered in dark black letters in the top left corner of an otherwise empty white page. In this way, a distance is brought about between Tardi’s personal account (including trauma) and German, ‘non-French’ recipients. The deviations on the title page seem tactful both with respect to the author, French readers and German recipients (cf. Schultze 2017b: 204).

A further case of deviation in paratext is the appendix. Tardi’s enumeration of 34 films and 39 books which had inspired him is completed in the German translation. E.g., French translations of films and books are also rendered in their original English versions (Tardi 2013: [124]; Tardi & Hein 2013: 125). Research on Tardi’s album and possible sources of textual and pictorial material can certainly profit from the German translation. In this respect, target side recipients appear as privileged readers. Summarizing, it can be stated the deviations in paratextual make-up of the German translation of ‘Trench warfare’ are plausible. ‘Grabenkrieg’ is a case of remarkable translational achievement.<sup>20</sup>

The Czech graphic novel *Alois Nebel*, originally a trilogy,<sup>21</sup> challenges translators through intratext in different components of paratext. While in other

---

**19** This cover resembles a picture contained in additional paratext, i.e. an appendix of 45 uncounted pages, mainly pictorial material, in the 2014 edition of ‘Trench warfare’: “*Vues du front après la bataille* – Portfolio 1996, éd. Jour de fête, galerie Sans Titre” (Tardi 2014: [28]). The German team, so it seems, had access to Tardi’s – open for further paratext – project.

**20** It is noticeable the second edition of ‘Trench warfare’ can not only stand for further enrichment of paratext, i.e. through the addition of pictorial material at the end of the edition and the equipment of the inserted narration with two more pictures (Tardi 2014: [27–30]). There are also meaningful changes, e.g., the dedication to the grandfather and both medals are replaced by different pictorial material. The picture on the book cover is now taken from the main text. The strategy of ‘work-in-progress’, then, includes the author’s gaining distance from the remarkably personal account in the first edition of the album.

**21** We are using the second (2011) single book edition.

graphic narratives, e.g., the Polish album *Powstanie*, single pictures from the main text are quoted in paratext, *Alois Nebel* excels in pieces of verbal text connecting main text and paratext. This aesthetic device calls for translators' specific attention.

While Tardi's 'Trench warfare' concerns the First World War as a case of human experience and reflection on mankind's behavior in view of historical catastrophes, the Czech graphic novel *Alois Nebel* refers to individual and collective experience during the Second World War and communist rule in East Middle Europe, especially during transition to free living conditions around and after 1989. In contrast to the French album, there is no central matter of concern. And different from the French project carried through by author and artist in one person, *Alois Nebel* is a case of teamwork: Jaroslav Rudiš cooperates as author and main texter, Jaromír Švejdík as painter and letterer, but also as poet (Schultze 2017a: 55–57; Schultze 2017b: 208).

The main figure and narrator (a centre of consciousness, respectively) of the black and white graphic novel, *Alois Nebel* (i.e. 'fog', 'mist') is a railway man at the station Bílý Potok at the Czech-Polish border – former Sudeten. It is noticeable Jaroslav Rudiš's grandfather had served as example of the railway man (Schultze 2016: 43; Ebbinghaus 2017: 18). The family name "Nebel" is specifically plotrelevant: Frequently sinking down on the landscape, fog stirs Alois' hallucinations going back to experience during the Second World War, e.g., a crime watched by Alois as a child, but also to directed by Nazi officers trains stopping at the station, the expulsion of Germans from Sudeten, experience connected with Russian (communist) occupation and the turmoil around 1989. Haunted by trauma, Alois is taken to a Mental Home for some time. He gets to know the Mute (Němý) who encourages him to more conscious dealing with the 'demons' of his past (A.C. Knigge in Gravett 2012: 853). Alois, a loner, satisfied with his job and his private passion, the collecting of old timetables, eventually finds his love, Květa, and becomes father of a small family.

In this graphic novel, specific tension is built up between linguistic and cultural hybridity of former East Middle Europe and in Czechoslovakia around 1989 on the one hand and Alois Nebel's Czech settledness on the other hand: recalling the tradition of Czech antiheroes, e.g., Hašek's Švejk and Hrabal's Miloš Hrma in 'Sharply controlled trains' (*Ostře sledované vlaky*), Alois Nebel challenges the world of the beginning 21<sup>st</sup> century, i.e. a world directed toward permanent acceleration, global mobility and pursuit of profit. In contrast to Alois' colloquial Czech (mainly common Czech, *obecná čeština*), there is linguistic hybridity based on German, Polish, Slovak, Russian, Russian-Ukrainian and English inserted into dominant Czech. Graphic hybridity is mainly given through Cyrillic inserted into the dominant Latin script (Schultze 2017a: 57; Schultze [2018]). Alois Nebel's



settledness, Middle East European fate and the more than average linguistic hybridity are also tangible in paratext – as will be shown, partly in the source, partly however, in the target text.

With a main text of 358 uncounted pages,<sup>22</sup> the graphic novel is equipped with the following carrier media of paratext: front and back covers, front and back inner book covers, title page, two further pages with imprint and information concerning the edition. Pictorial items are contained on both book covers, the title page and one of the imprint pages following the main text. The latter component, a round white sign with a – similar to scissor-cuts –<sup>23</sup> small deer in a stylized forest, resembles pictorial items marking the transition from one part of the trilogy to the next. These pictorial items are treated as invariants in both translations to be looked into here, i.e. the German and the Polish translation.

Meaning making function is clearly contained in two portrayals of Alois Nebel, first on the book cover and then on the title page. While the book cover shows the railway man's "kind smile" ("gütiges Lächeln", A.C. Knigge in Gravett 2012: 853), the title page, announcing "Alois Nebel" "in the main role", presents an enigmatic, stern face. This means, already in paratext, tension is built up between a friendly, if not benevolent, and a – so it seems – burdened by experience figure. This tension functions as a reference to the main text with partly invigorating and funny, partly serious, depressing or ambivalent situations.

The textual components of paratext contain information on the contents of the graphic novel, the team of author and artist, further processing of the 'cult' graphic narrative (Schultze 2016: 51–52) and plain advertising.

Following the trilogy – Bílý Potok (White Brook), Hlavní Nádraží (Main Station), Zlaté Hory (Golden Mountains) – short summaries offer some cues to main contents. Characteristic of the whole graphic novel, enigma is clearly tangible. The second summary starts with Alois Nebel's considerations during his trip to Prague, i.e., it quotes from the main text:

*Někdo chce vidět majáky na ostrově Rujana, někdo si chce dát dort v Paříži a někdo chce vidět nejkrásnější železniční stanici v Čechách.*

Someone wants to see the lighthouses on the Isle of Rügen, someone wants to order a tart in Paris, and someone wants to see the prettiest railway station in Bohemia

---

<sup>22</sup> The German translation counts pages irregularly, yet, in a way pagination can be reconstructed for the whole text. Pagination in square brackets, especially in references to the Czech source and the Polish target texts, follows the German translation.

<sup>23</sup> Scissor-cuts in Švejdík's native Jeseník, Sudeten, are among the most tangible artistic inspirations in *Alois Nebel* (Schultze 2016: 45).

In the main text (Rudiš & Švejdík 2011: [121]), these considerations start in almost identical phrasing, culminate, however, in a clearly personal statement: “But I have always wanted to see the Main Station” (“A ja chtěl vždycky vidět Hlavní nádraží”). This statement, on the one hand, affirms the tradition of Czech settledness and of true to themselves and to their duties literary heroes. On the other hand, there is also a grain of irony: Rudiš frequently, especially in his novels, e.g., ‘Grandhotel’, mocks at his compatriots’ “being afraid of moving” (Schultze 2016: 52). Non-Czech recipients, unless they are acquainted with Czech literature, will probably not grasp the complete meaning making impulse of Alois Nebel’s considerations, the piece of intratext, respectively.

Substantial intratext is also contained between main text and the back cover. During his stay in the Mental Home, Alois, all of a sudden, feels himself again surrounded by fog. He tries to find some orientation: “Via railway you get everywhere today, to Lisbon just as to Auschwitz” (“Po kolejích se dneska člověk dostane všude, do Lisabonu stejně jako do Osvětimi”; Rudiš & Švejdík 2011 [76]). On the back cover, these lines are repeated within direct address to the reader:

*Po kolejích se dneska člověk dostane všude, do Lisabonu stejně jako do Osvětimi, do vlastní minulosti i do pochybnosti, které vám zanechali rodiče, příbuzní a přátelé. Příběhy ze století, o němž si myslíme, že už je dávno za námi.*

Via railway you get everywhere today, to Lisbon just as to Auschwitz, to your own past and to doubts which have been left to you by parents, relatives and friends. Events of a century we think we have left behind us long ago.

Attentive readers will grasp the message: that there is individual obligation to reconsider 20<sup>th</sup> century European history (Schultze 2017b: 211).<sup>24</sup> This component of paratext, at the same time an item of intratext, is specifically relevant for meaning making in *Alois Nebel*.

Comparative analysis, then, has to pay attention to these carrier media of paratext: front and back covers, title page and front inner book cover. Starting from Eva Profousová’s German translation (2006, 2012), it can be stated Profousová retains the pictorial make-up of the front cover and the title page.<sup>25</sup> The initial meaning making tension between both portraits of the railway man Alois Nebel is rendered in the target text. The inner front cover likewise summarizes basic

<sup>24</sup> A history teacher by profession, Rudiš makes it a point the shadows of the past are still, i.e. even in 2017, tangible (Ebbinghaus 2017: 18).

<sup>25</sup> The German translation (here: the second, 2012, edition) does not inform about a letterer and/or further experts involved in decision making around script, e.g., cases of retouching in the main text (e.g., pp. [342–343]) and other deviations.

contents, however, in a mixture of direct transfer, paraphrase and replacement of single pieces of text by different information. Alois' considerations concerning desired destinations ("Někdo chce vidět [...]") are omitted. They are retained in the main text (Rudiš & Profousová 2012: 121). There is additional paratext easily to be taken in by German readers: "Die Berliner Mauer ist gefallen und den real existierenden Sozialismus gibt es nicht mehr" ("The Berlin Wall has come down and socialism as existing in reality is gone"). German readers can take this as an indication of date. Similarly, the truly momentous address to readers on the back cover ("Po kolejích [...]") is omitted. Again, the main text is rendered in accordance with the source text (Rudiš & Profousová 2012: 76). However, there is some new paratext, a paragraph informing about main contents of the graphic novel. Probably worded by the translator herself, this extra paratext may support readers' reception of *Alois Nebel*.

The omission of intratext has to be questioned. Trying to render the translation as accessible to German readers as possible, the translator misses the device of emphasizing specifically meaningful statements of the main text.

Next to omission and exchange of single pieces of paratext, there is also enrichment of paratextual components. While author and artist leave it up to readers how they will handle linguistic hybridity (including traces of gypsy language and plenty of Czech vocabulary derived from German), the translator equips the graphic novel with an appendix (Rudiš & Profousová 2012: [359]) containing 13 translations of Russian micro-texts written in Cyrillic. This appendix is quite in line with transfer options in the German translation: While author and artist conceive of self-determined, active readers who will find out for themselves how they will cope with linguistic hybridity, Profousová, in creating a translation in largely homogeneous German, tends to conceive of passive recipients (Schultze 2017a: 59–60, 64). It is noticeable the appendix (*Übersetzungen russisch-deutsch*) cannot go for a case of reliable translation. Several items of Russian text written in Cyrillic (there is also Russian text in Latin script) are either shortened or left untranslated, there is even retouching in the printed text (Schultze 2017a: 59; Schultze 2017b: 211–212). The deviations in the appendix are not plausible.

Similarly as Rudiš and Švejdlík, the Polish translator Michał Słomka obviously conceives of readers willing to handle linguistic hybridity in a position of self-determination. There is no extra paratext helping with translations (e.g., from German into Polish). Słomka is, no doubt, in a privileged position as translator: Polish can mostly stay remarkably close to the Czech source text, and inner-Slavic linguistic hybridity, with but a few exceptions, can be rendered in identical shape. Printed in three separate volumes, the Polish version of the graphic novel somewhat differs from the final trilogy. While the title pages of all three volumes repeat Alois Nebel's enigmatically stern face and the back covers offer identical informa-

tion about the main characters, the front covers present Alois in different situations. The front covers are identical with the front covers of the first edition of *Alois Nebel* in three separate volumes.<sup>26</sup> So there is remarkable consistency in the pictorial program. And yet, the inner coherence between paratext and main text is not yet fully realized. E.g., the statement concerning the role of railways and the need of reconsidering European history on the back cover of the single book edition of *Alois Nebel* may not have been in Słomka's source text version (German: Vorlage). Moreover, Słomka, so it seems, feels remarkably free in processing paratext. The summaries of the single parts of the trilogy are given in a type of 'interpreting paraphrase'. Alois' considerations concerning the lighthouses on the Isle of Rügen, though contained in the main text (Rudiš & Słomka 2007: [121]), are not rendered in the inner back cover. It cannot be excluded the translator was not aware of the poetic device of intratext in graphic novels.

Enriched paratext which goes far beyond additional paratext in the translated graphic novels looked into so far, has to do with the fact Słomka wants to win Polish readers for the genre. On the inner back of the front page, the translator ("Michał Słomka, tłumacz") and, maybe, a designer (Witold Tkaczyk), inform about a new series devoted to the "Art of Comics in Middle Europe" – with *Alois Nebel* as first paradigm. On the inner part of the back cover, the reader is implicitly addressed in this way: "We know ["Wiemy"] that Prague is golden like Czech beer." The enlarged paratext informs about the coming into being of the graphic novel, main background of author and artist, historical context of Alois Nebel's fate, the meaning making function of "Nebel" ("mgła") and further details (Schultze 2017b: 214). Paratext in service of promoting the genre "graphic novel", so it seems, in this case somewhat impairs carefulness in handling paratext. Next to ample rephrasing, even redundancies are admitted in paratext.

## 5 Enriched paratext in Russ Kick's project *Graphic Canon* and in the German and Polish translations

Containing multimodal adaptations and excerpts of pieces of literature from all over the world (including oral tradition), Russ Kick's project *Graphic Canon* is a specific case of paratext in graphic narrative. The editor's first object was to create a

---

<sup>26</sup> The back covers of the single book editions (2006, 2011) recall the pictorial make-up of the previous three-volume edition.

survey “spanning centuries, countries, languages, and genres”. A further object was the wish readers of the graphic narratives would turn to the original texts. Artists cooperating in the project were expected to stay close to the meaning making presented in the originals (Kick 2012: 1). Contributors, then, should refrain from parody or “satirical commentary” sometimes to be found in canonic texts transformed into graphic narration (cf. Schmitz-Emans 2013: 399). Though not voiced in Kick’s introduction, readers are neither expected to “know the texts referred to” nor “connect some ideas with them” (Schmitz-Emans 2013: 400). Paratext evidently has to introduce ‘first readers’ into a large choice of canonic texts. Next to supporting readers in their reception of new (abridged) pieces of literature, paratext also has to pave the way for future reading of one or the other complete text.

Out of the three-volume anthology, only the first, 2012, volume, *From the ‘Epic of Gilgamesh’ to Shakespeare, to ‘Dangerous Liaisons’* and its complete German translation (2013) and an incomplete – containing only 27 out of 55 texts – Polish version (2014) will be included in comparative analysis.<sup>27</sup> In the first volume of *Graphic Canon*, the carrier media of paratext are: front and back covers, title page, pages with imprint, table of contents, acknowledgements, the “Editor’s Introduction” and a remarkably informative appendix (pp. 486–502). Further pieces of paratext are contained within the anthology. Every ‘sample’ of canonic literature is preceded by an introduction (one page) concerning the genre, international status, main contents, maybe linguistic specifics and further detail of the given text. The appendix contains five different types of information – entrances suggesting “Further reading” for every single canonic text (with succinct bibliographical data on translations and outstanding secondary literature; 486–493), detailed data on the “Contributors” to the anthology (494–499), information about the sources for every piece of graphic narrative, many of which had been “created especially for this volume” (“Credits and Permissions”; 500), indices of “Titles”, “Authors/Poets”, “Artists/Adaptors” and “Countries/Areas of Origin” (501–502). While the appendix, except for a small picture on the last page, goes without pictorial items, there are pictorial components on the imprint-page, the table of contents and the back cover. Since these items of paratext mainly concern the concept of the multimodal anthology, they will not be discussed here.

---

<sup>27</sup> It is not easy to ascertain the actual state of Kick’s international project, i.e. translational achievement in different countries. Volume 2 of Kick’s anthology also appeared in 2012: *From Kubla Khan to the Brontë Sisters to The Picture of Dorian Gray*, volume 3 is available since 2013: *From Heart of Darkness to Hemingway to Infinite Jest*. The German translation of volume 2 is available since 2015: *Von Tristram Shandy über Jane Austen bis Dorian Gray*. The translation of volume 3 has not yet appeared. The German editor Wolfgang Hörner (Kick 2013: 1) mentions forthcoming translations in French and Turkish. By now, all three volumes are indeed available in French.

The make-up of the German and the Polish versions of *Graphic Canon* differs considerably. This is not only caused by the fact that the Polish anthology contains only half of the canonic texts – *Od ‘Gilgamesza’ do ‘Tybetańskiej księgi umarłych’*. While the German translations are done by a team of 11 translators, the Polish translation (the only Slavic *Graphic Canon* we have) was the ‘Herculean task’ of one single translator, Dorota Kozińska.<sup>28</sup>

The appendix of the German translation corresponds to the English anthology. In some instances, the invitation to reading activity is even intensified. E.g., the first section, “Further reading”, is called “Zum Weiterlesen”, i.e. ‘To keep on reading’; the translation of the second part of paratext highlights the performative aspect of cooperation – “Mitwirkende” (‘active participants’). The sequence of indices is enlarged by a ‘translators’ register’: “Übersetzer/in” (Kick 2013: 503). In accordance with the reader-oriented project, the data concerning “Further reading” are adapted to the needs of German recipients. Readers are informed about older and more recent translations into German and especially valid secondary literature, but also about specifically prestigious English translations and scholarly contributions (e.g., Kick 2013: 186). Similarly as in the Tardi case, readers of the German translation are partly equipped with enriched paratext, i.e. appear to be in a privileged position. The artists’ biographies (“Contributors”) are just translated into German (Schultze 2017b: 218–219). In the Polish edition, in contrast, the appendix only informs about the “Contributors” (“Autorzy”) contained in this shorter version of the Canon (Kick 2014: 288–291) and “Credits and Permissions” (“Nota edytorska”; *ibid.*: 292). So this appears to be a case of tangible omission of paratext.

Comparative analysis will only concern two canonic texts – an excerpt from the “Epic of Gilgamesh” (the Sixth Tablet) and “Fragments” (it is known posterity only disposes of little more than fragments) of Sappho’s poetry. What interests most is translational transfer of paratext preceding both samples, i.e. deviation in favour of target readers, possible implied instructions for translators and translators’ response to such hints but also information offered in the appendix, in this case, the German appendix.

Showing remarkable scholarly commitment, the piece of paratext preceding the Bull-episode affirms the seriousness of Kick’s project. The excerpt taken from a complete graphic novel by Kevin Dixon is based on a rendition (German “Wiedergabe”) by Kevin Dixon’s father Kent who had not only consulted “more than two dozen translations and renditions” in English and further languages but also “learned to read” part of the “symbols of the Assyrian syllabary” (Kick 2012: 2). The

---

<sup>28</sup> The publication informs about the shortened anthology in the imprint (Kick 2014: IV), however, without giving reasons for the different deviations from Kick’s concept.

excerpt relates the Bull of Heaven episode, i.e. Gilgamesh's rejection of the goddess Ishtar, Ishtar's leading the Bull down to the earth to ruin Gilgamesh and Uruk and Gilgamesh's and Enkidu's killing of the Bull. Kent Dixon's explanations concerning his rendition imply instructions for translators: "I wanted a translation that would appeal to college students and general readers, so I biased mine toward the sensory dimension in which the original is weak" (Kick 2012: 2). While some of the ductus of ancient epic (with partly stately narration and the repetitive contact interjection "O") is tangible in small pieces of narrative, about 100 onomatopoeia in the 'scenic' presentation of the Bull-episode – on only 15 pages – "evoke" the "vivid sensory world" aimed at by the Dixons (Kick 2012: 2; cf. Schultze [2018]).<sup>29</sup>

Anja Hansen-Schmidt's German translation of the piece of paratext follows the source text in presenting ample factual data and scholarly information as appealing reading material. With respect to the Bull-episode it can be stated the translator retains most of the ductus of the narrative parts and stays remarkably close to the graphic narrative for "students and general readers". A web of partly English and partly German, i.e. linguistically hybrid onomatopoeia stands for the "vivid sensual world", but also for hybridity as a general marker of 21<sup>st</sup> century culture (Schultze [2018]). With respect to the appendix it is noticeable the German index "Zum Weiterlesen" (To keep on reading) combines general information taken from Kick's source text ("Further Reading") with recommendations of recent German translations of the *Epic of Gilgamesh*. At the same time, the entrance recommends the "ultimate" English translation by Andrew George (Kick 2013: 486). Target side readers, then, can profit from enriched paratext bringing to mind the inherent internationality by mankind's literary heritage.<sup>30</sup>

The piece of paratext preceding Dorota Kozińska's Polish translation of the Bull-episode likewise aims at retaining dense information and good readability. In brackets, Polish recipients are told the Polish versions of the epic by Józef Wittlin and Robert Stiller are also renditions ("adaptacje", Kick 2014: 2). So Polish readers get to know where they might carry on reading.

However, in her translation of the Bull-episode, Kozińska seems to have forgotten about the recipients conceived of in the piece of paratext. The ductus of epic narrative is partly dissolved (through abolition of inversions, doing away with the coherence of the contact interjection "o") and the texture of onomato-

---

<sup>29</sup> Regardless of this reader-oriented enrichment of the epic with linguistic markers appertaining to graphic narratives, the first text of the anthology is indeed „one of the more accurate“ (Kick 2012: 2) versions of the Bull-episode. It is suited to acquaint readers with some of the canonic text.

<sup>30</sup> In the German version of *Graphic Canon*, enrichment of paratext also concerns pictorial components. A picture of the Bull-episode (Kick 2012: 9) is rendered on both the front and the back covers of the anthology.

poeia is partly changed, so it recalls children's literature ("AUC", "AAAPSIHK!"); Kick 2014: 10–13; cf. Schultze [2018]). So the translator causes contradiction between paratext and main text which is not plausible. Informed correctly in paratext, readers are misdirected through translational transfer of the main text.

Presented on only one page, the Fragments of Sappho's poetry, a textual-pictorial creation by Russ Kick and the artist Alessandro Bonaccorsi, offer a choice of single lines and just a few lines decorated on both sides of a Greek woman's small face and slender shoulders (Kick 2012: 66). Kick's arrangement shows an amazingly many-sided portrait of the gifted poetess, prudent woman, loving mother of a daughter, inhabitant of Lesbos. The lines in the Greek source text can be easily traced. What interests here is translational transfer of paratext preceding the textual-pictorial portrait, coherence between meaning making cues in paratext and main text and, with respect to the German translation, information for readers in the appendix.

With one exception, the German translation of introductory paratext follows Kick's dense text. While Kick in one instant quotes Edwin Marion Cox's partly, so it seems, somewhat simplified phrasing, the unnamed team of German translators retains poetic marking: "I have two minds, / I know not what to do" – "Weiß nicht, was ich zu tun, denn entzweit ist das Denken mir" (Kick 2012: 65; Kick 2013: 65; cf. Schultze 2017b: 220). Changing between plain statement, prudent reflection and utterances full of poetic device, the German translation of the Fragments achieves specific closeness to the canonic Greek text. The piece of paratext in the appendix, "Zum Weiterlesen", does not refer to information for English readers (Kick 2012: 486). In this case, paratext only addresses German recipients.

The Polish paratext preceding the – inappropriately called "Strofy" – Fragments (Schultze 2017b: 222), informs readers the "Strofy" are based on Cox's translation rendered in Polish by a Greek expert (Kick 2014: 65). The piece of Sappho's poetry quoted in paratext appears specifically plain: "Trudno się zdecydować / Dwie myśli mnie dręczą" (Kick 2014: 65; "It is hard to decide [come to a decision] / Two thoughts are tormenting me"). Similarly as in this paraphrasing rendering, the Polish main text clearly deviates from the English and the German Fragments of Sappho's poetry – through more paraphrase, retouching, reordering of pieces of text. There is no mention of Lesbos. In this instant, the translator seems to have been unaware of the distance brought about by Sappho's singular status voiced in paratext ("na równi z Homerem"; Kick 2014: 65) and the 'textual portrait' given in "Strofy" (Schultze 2017b: 223).<sup>31</sup>

---

**31** It is noticeable the incongruencies between paratext and main text tangible in the Bull-episode and in the Sappho Fragment are not typical of all of Kozińska's translations. E.g., the



## 6 Summary

Though based on a limited amount of graphic novels, this study shows the textual-pictorial make-up of paratext is remarkably varied. And so is the meaning making function. Of course, in many graphic novels of the last decades, paratext is too limited and too unobtrusive to justify ambiguous scholarly research. E. g., in Mariko and Jillian Tamaki's bestseller *This One Summer* (2014, the German translation appeared in 2015), paratext, outside of advertising, consists of a front cover announcing holidays on the beach and short blurbs warning: "But this summer is different" and the title page (Schultze 2017b: 215–217). To give a Polish example, in Krzysztof Gawronkiewicz's and Krystian Rosenberg's album *Achtung Zelig!* (the Polish edition appeared in 2004, the French translation in 2005), paratext is limited to front cover, title page and a short afterword with mainly general information (Gawronkiewicz & Rosenberg 2005: [55]). On the other hand, there are graphic novels with relatively limited, however, substantial for meaning making paratext. The album *Powstanie* by Krzysztof Gawronkiewicz and Marzena Sowa is a characteristic example. Moreover, there is a large variety of graphic novels with enriched paratext. Enrichment may concern textual components, especially introductions and appendices, e.g. in Tardi's 'Trench warfare' and in Russ Kick's *Graphic Canon*. Enrichment may also consist in more or less extensive afterwords, be it by the author himself, be it by one or the other expert of the topic treated in the graphic novel. The latter is the case in Reinhard Kleist's *Der Boxer*. Pictorial items of paratext are found almost everywhere outside of the main text: on front and back covers, title pages, blurbs, in introductions, tables of contents, imprints and on extra pages with pictorial material. With respect to the graphic novels discussed here and a number of texts not included in this study, it can be stated front and back covers and title pages are especially important carrier media of meaning making. E.g. the medal of Tardi's grandfather with blood flowing down behind the medal focusses the absurdity of any war – in fact, in a way hardly to be put into words. The medal presented on the back cover, with blood flowing upwards, of course, heightens the message of absurdity. Another example, Alois Nebel's enigmatic face on the title page of the Czech graphic novel covers much of enigmatic constellations throughout the main text.

---

translation of Valerie Schrag's adaptation of "Lysistrata" stays close to the English text (Schultze 2017b: 222).

Obviously unnoticed in scholarly discussion on graphic narratives, textual and pictorial intratext is an important aesthetic device in the make-up of paratext. In Tardi's album 'Trench warfare', intratext, among others, is created between the introduction and the pattern of onomatopoeia ("AAA") in the main text. In the Czech graphic novel *Alois Nebel*, central meaning making intratext consists in the message to reconsider 20<sup>th</sup> century history (Aufarbeitung von Geschichte). In the Polish album *Powstanie*, textual-pictorial intratext – the picture of Edward and Alicja on the back cover and Edward's remark "Wystarczy być Polakiem, żeby umrzeć" in the main text – is a momentous reference to the Nazi regime's contempt of Poles. The connection between paratext and main text, then, is remarkably dense.

Comparative analysis of source and target texts reveals only some of the translators of graphic novels are aware of intratext in the high quality examples of the genre they translate.

With respect to paratext in translated graphic novels, these deviations and further specifics are noticeable: omission of textual and/or pictorial items, shifting of single pictures, exchange of textual and/or pictorial material, non-observance of intratext, non-observance of paratextual instructions for translators. It is important to note some of these deviations are fully plausible. They happen in favour of target readers. Others, however, may impair central aspects of meaning making.

Next to omission of a number of data irrelevant for reader's meaning making process, e.g. personal data concerning authors and artists, there are omissions of clear relevance. Omission of reference to individual responsibility in handling historical memory on the back cover of the German translation of *Alois Nebel* certainly matters. So does omission of several indices in the incomplete Polish edition of *Graphic Canon*. This omission of information for potential readers of complete canonic texts leads away from Kick's project. Shifting of single pictorial items of paratext, e.g. in the Czech translation of Kleist's *Der Boxer*, obviously does not affect central aspects of meaning making. And yet, single cases of shifting might be questioned with respect to plausibility. Exchange of textual and pictorial material, however, may be relevant. The exchange of the grandfather's medal on the title page of 'Trench warfare' into the horrifying picture of a rat, i.e. a picture taken from the main text, is fully plausible. So is the exchange of textual components on the back cover of the Polish translation of Färber's *Reprobis*. Equipped with information taken from Cordula Patzig's "Afterword", first readers of the graphic novel can profit substantially.

But there are cases of exchange which have to be questioned. Changing the pictures of Edward and Alicja on the back cover of *Powstanie*, the French translation tangibly affects intratext and meaning making. The political message of the

source text concerning utter humiliation of any Pole through the Nazi regime should not have been faded out.<sup>32</sup>

While translational transfer on the back cover of *Powstanie* can be seen as exchange of intratext, there are also cases of non-observance of intratext, e.g., in the German and Polish translations of *Alois Nebel*. Reference to the “lighthouses on the Isle of Rügen” (touching upon Alois’ Czech settledness) are not retained in the blurbs of the target texts. There is reason to assume both translators were not aware of intratext as aesthetic device. Non-observance of implicit paratextual instructions for translators is especially tangible in Dorota Kozińska’s translation of the Bull-episode (for students and other grown-ups, not for children), and of the Sappho Fragments leading away from the portrait of the canonic poetess.<sup>33</sup>

While in the case of several Polish translations assembled in *Graphic Canon* Polish readers are clearly misdirected (Schultze 2017b: 222–223; Schultze [2018]) there are several cases of translational transfer putting target readers in a privileged position. In the appendix going with ‘Trench warfare’, German readers get more precise biographical data; in the appendix to *Graphic Canon*, German recipients are not only informed about translations and helpful secondary reading in German but (partly though) also in English. Sometimes, translated graphic narratives contain paratext exclusively made available to target readers (cf. note 13).<sup>34</sup> This shows graphic narratives are conceived as belonging to an international world of multimodal text.

Coming to a conclusion, it can be stated paratext in graphic novels, be it in source, be it in target texts, is still a rather neglected topic. This study could evidently profit from a number of Slavic source and target texts. It is to be hoped future projects concerning graphic novels (cf. Platthaus 2016) will include Slavic texts more than before.<sup>35</sup> Of course, considering the amount of high quality graphic novels incessantly appearing in many countries and considering the fact comparative analysis of graphic narratives is more than average time-consuming, there will always be a deficit in research.

---

**32** Jochen Böhrer (2017: 6) gives details of this – unforgettable till now – terror: “Beginning with the first day of war, Poles, literally over-night, had become fair game.”

**33** It is to be regretted Kozińska was not supported by further Polish translators.

**34** The German translation of the Polish graphic novel *Fugazi Music Club* by Marcin Podolec (2013) is enriched by an interview with the author (Podolec & Sawicki 2016: 232–235).

**35** There are recent – mainly contents-directed – publications acquainting German readers with the actual state of graphic narrative in Poland (Kupczynska & Makarska 2016; Kochanowski 2016). However, aspects of translational transfer are missing.

## References

### Source texts and translations

- Anonymous. 2012. The Epic of Gilgamesh. Babylonian tablets. Adaptation by Kevin Dixon, rendition by Kent Dixon. In Russ Kick (ed.), *The Graphic Canon 1. From the "Epic of Gilgamesh" to Shakespeare, to "Dangerous Liaisons"*, 2–18. New York: Seven Stories Press.
- Anonymous. 2013. Das Gilgamesch-Epos. Babylonische Tontafeln. Adaptation von Kevin Dixon. Übertragung aus dem Babylonischen ins Englische von Kent Dixon. Deutsche Übersetzung von Anja Hansen-Schmidt. In Russ Kick (ed.), *The Graphic Canon 1. Von "Gilgamesch" über Shakespeare bis "Gefährliche Liebschaften"*. Aus dem amerikanischen Englisch von Klaus Binder, Karlheinz Dürr, Anne Emmert, Katja Hald, Anja Hansen-Schmidt, Elsbeth Ranke, Tobias Roth, Heike Schlatterer, Stephanie Singh, Reinhard Tiffert, Joachim Utz, 2–18. Berlin: Galiani.
- Anonymous. 2014. Gilgamesz Epos akadyjski na tabliczkach glinianych. Rysunki i scenariusz Kevin Dixon, adaptacja Kent Dixon. Przetoczyła Dorota Koziańska. In Russ Kick (ed.), *Kanon graficzny 1. Od "Gilgamesza" do "Tybetańskiej Księgi Umarłych"*. Przetoczyła Dorota Koziańska, 2–18. Warszawa: Grupa Wydawnicza Foksal.
- Färber, Markus. 2012. *Reprobus*. Nachwort: Cordula Patzig. Kassel: Rotopolpress.
- Färber, Markus. 2014. *Reprobus*. Posłowie: Cordula Patzig. Tłumaczenie: Grzegorz Janusz. Warszawa: Kultura gniewu.
- Gawronkiewicz, Krzysztof & Krystian Rosenberg. 2005. *Achtung Zelig!* Traduction du polonais: Weronika Kasprzak. Postface de Grzegorz Rosinski. Casterman.
- Gawronkiewicz, Krzysztof [Rysunki] & Marzena Sowa [Scenariusz]. 2014. *Powstanie. 1. Za dzień, za dwa*. Warszawa: Kultura gniewu.
- Gawronkiewicz, Krzysztof & Marzena Sowa. 2014. *L'insurrection. 1. Avant l'orage*. Dupuis.
- Kick, Russ (ed.). 2012. *The Graphic Canon 1. From the "Epic of Gilgamesh" to Shakespeare, to "Dangerous Liaisons"*. New York: Seven Stories Press.
- Kick, Russ (ed.). 2013. *The Graphic Canon 1. Von "Gilgamesch" über Shakespeare bis "Gefährliche Liebschaften"*. Aus dem amerikanischen Englisch von Klaus Binder, Karlheinz Dürr, Anne Emmert, Katja Hald, Anja Hansen-Schmidt, Elsbeth Ranke, Tobias Roth, Heike Schlatterer, Stephanie Singh, Reinhard Tiffert, Joachim Utz. Berlin: Galiani.
- Kick, Russ (ed.). 2014. *Kanon graficzny 1. Od "Gilgamesza" do "Tybetańskiej Księgi Umarłych"*. Przetoczyła Dorota Koziańska. Warszawa: Grupa Wydawnicza Foksal.
- Kleist, Reinhard. 2012. *Der Boxer. Die wahre Geschichte des Hertzko Haft*. Nach dem Buch Eines Tages werde ich alles erzählen von Alan Scott Haft. Hamburg: Carlsen Verlag.
- Kleist, Reinhard. 2015. *Boxer. Pravdivý příběh Hercka Hafta*. Podle knihy Alana Scotta Hafta Jednou budu o všem vyprávět. Přeložila Alena Pokorná. Praha: Argo.
- Klajst, Rajnhard. 2016. *Bokser. Istinita priča Hercka Hafta*. Prema knjizi Jednog dana sve ću ispričati Alena Scotta Hafta. Prevela s nemačkog Marina Popov. Novi Sad: Kominko.
- Podolec, Marcin. 2016. *Fugazi Music Club*. Aus dem Polnischen übersetzt und mit Anmerkungen versehen von Jakub Sawicki. Köln: Egmont.
- Rudiš, Jaroslav & Jaromír 99 [= Jaromír Švejdlík]. 2007. *Alois Nebel. [1:] Biały Potok. [2:] Dworzec Główny. [3:] Żłote Góry. Powieść graficzna*. Przekład polski: Michał Słomka. Poznań: Zin Zin Press.

- Rudiš, Jaroslav & Jaromír 99 [= Jaromír Švejdlík]. 2011. *Alois Nebel. Kreslená románová trilogie*. Praha: Labyrint.
- Rudiš, Jaroslav & Jaromír 99 [= Jaromír Švejdlík]. 2012. *Alois Nebel*. Aus dem Tschechischen von Eva Profousová. Leipzig & Dresden: Volland & Quist.
- Savoia, Sylvain [Zeichnungen], Marzena Sowa [Texte] & Alessandro Benedetti [Lettering]. 2012. *Marzi 1984–1987*. Übersetzung: Michael Leimer. Stuttgart: Panini.
- Tamaki, Mariko & Jillian Tamaki. 2014. *This One Summer*. New York: Roaring Book Press.
- Tamaki, Mariko & Jillian Tamaki. 2015. *Ein Sommer am See*. Aus dem Englischen von Tina Hohl. Berlin: Reprodukt.
- Tardi, Jacques. 1993. *C'était la guerre des tranchées*. Bruxelles: Casterman.
- Tardi, Jacques. 2013. *Grabenkrieg*. Übersetzung aus dem Französischen: Michael Hein. 2. Aufl. Zürich: Edition Moderne.
- Tardi, Jacques. 2014. *C'était la guerre des tranchées*. Nouvelle Edition Bruxelles: Casterman.

## Secondary literature

- Böhler, Jochen. 2017. Nur ein Leben als ob. Während der deutschen Besetzung Polens von 1939–1944 waren die Bewohner des Landes rechtlose Gejagte. Das Ausmaß der Gewalt übersteigt das Vorstellungsvermögen – die Folgen des Terrors sind in Polen bis heute zu spüren. In *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung* 2017 (229). 6.
- Ebbinghaus, Uwe. 2017. Mit Kafka in der Kneipe. In Europa liegen Vergangenheit und Gegenwart, Herkunfts- und Wohnort, Kulturen, Sprachen und Trinkgewohnheiten nahe beieinander: Eine deutsch-tschechische Szene in Bremen, rund um ein Musiktheaterprojekt des Schriftstellers Jaroslav Rudiš. In *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung* 2017 (239). 18.
- Genette, Gerard. 2001. *Paratexts. Thresholds of interpretation*. Transl. by Jane E. Lewin. Foreword by Richard Macksey (= Literature, Culture, Theory. 20). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gravett, Paul (ed.). 2012. *1001 Comics, die Sie lesen sollten, bevor das Leben vorbei ist*. Vorwort, Übersetzung und deutsche Bearbeitung von Andreas C. Knigge. Zürich: Edition Olms AG.
- Kaindl, Klaus. 2015. Von den Rändern ins Zentrum oder: Was kann die Übersetzungswissenschaft von Comics lernen? In Nathalie Mälzer (ed.), *Comics – Übersetzungen und Adaptionen* (= TRANSÜD. 76), 25–46. Berlin: Frank & Timme.
- Knoben, Martina. 2017. Der Comic-Künstler Reinhard Kleist plant eine Graphic Novel über den schwulen Boxer Emile Griffith. Um sich mit der Figur vertraut zu machen, zeichnet er Skizze um Skizze. In *Süddeutsche Zeitung* 2017 (249). 24.
- Kochanowski, Marek. 2016. Stadt, Provinz, Provinzstadt im polnischen Comic nach 1989. In Kalina Kupczynska & Renata Makarska (eds.), *Comic in Polen. Polen im Comic* (= Bildnarrative. Studien zu Comics und Bilderzählungen. 4), 139–153. Berlin: Christian A. Bachmann Verlag.
- Kupczynska, Kalina & Renata Makarska (eds.). 2016. *Comic in Polen. Polen im Comic* (= Bildnarrative. Studien zu Comics und Bilderzählungen. 4). Berlin: Christian A. Bachmann Verlag.
- Laser, Björn & Michael Groenewald. 2015. Jimmy Corrigan's Fliege: Über das Übersetzen von Bildern. In Nathalie Mälzer (ed.), *Comics – Übersetzungen und Adaptionen* (= TRANSÜD. 76), 235–249. Berlin: Frank & Timme.

- Meyer, Christine. 2013. Un/Taming the Beast, or Graphic Novels (Re)Considered. In Daniel Stein & Jan-Noël Thon (eds.), *From Comic Strips to Graphic Novels. Contributions to the Theory and History of Graphic Narrative* (= Narratologia. 37), 271–299. Berlin & Boston: Walter de Gruyter.
- Platthaus, Andreas. 2016. Wiedergeburt des Mythos. Eine Leipziger Tagung zur Darstellung der Geschichte in Comics lenkte den Blick nicht nur auf Westeuropa, sondern auch auf Polen und sogar auf die Volksrepublik China. In *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung* 2016 (109). N3.
- Rabe, Jens-Christian. 2016. Pop in Noir. Ed Piskor und seine Geschichte des Hip-Hop als Comic. In *Süddeutsche Zeitung* 2016 (276). 14.
- Schmitz-Emans, Monika. 2013. Graphic Narrative as World Literature. In Daniel Stein & Jan-Noël Thon (eds.), *From Comic Strips to Graphic Novels. Contributions to the Theory and History of Graphic Narrative* (= Narratologia. 37), 387–406. Berlin & Boston: Walter de Gruyter.
- Schultze, Brigitte. 2015. Hybrid Constellations and National Authorship: Prose Fiction by Jaroslav Rudiš (2002–2013) and Olga Martynova (2013). In *Rocznik Komparatystyczny. Comparative Yearbook* 2015 (6). 69–89.
- Schultze, Brigitte. 2016. Hybridity Maintained, Reduced, Abolished and Redefined: The Czech Graphic Novel “Alois Nebel” (Jaroslav Rudiš, Jaromír 99, 2006) in Polish and German. In *Rocznik Komparatystyczny. Comparative Yearbook. Komparatistisches Jahrbuch* 2016 (7). 41–55.
- Schultze, Brigitte. 2017a. Graphic novel (comic) and translation: Constitutive components and selective deviation evaluated. In Beate Sommerfeld et al. (eds.), *Übersetzungskritisches Handeln. Modelle und Fallstudien* (= Studien zur Germanistik, Skandinavistik und Übersetzungskultur. 16), 43–68. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Edition.
- Schultze, Brigitte. 2017b. Respected, supported, misdirected: the reader of/in translated graphic novels. In Piotr Sulikowski, Anna Sulikowska & Emil Lesner (eds.), *Translation Landscapes. Internationale Schriften zur Übersetzungswissenschaft*. 1 (= Translatologie. 16), 191–229. Hamburg: Dr. Kovač.
- Schultze, Brigitte. [2018]. Strategies of meaning making in the focus: onomatopoeia and interjections in translated graphic novels. In Piotr Sulikowski, Anna Sulikowska & Emil Lesner (eds.), *Translation Landscapes. Internationale Schriften zur Übersetzungswissenschaft*. 2 (= Translatologie.). Hamburg: Dr. Kovač.
- Stein, Daniel & Jan-Noël Thon (eds.). 2013. *From Comic Strips to Graphic Novels. Contributions to the Theory and History of Graphic Narrative* (= Narratologia. 37). Berlin & Boston: Walter de Gruyter.
- Stein, Daniel. 2013. Superhero Comics and the Authorizing Functions of the Comic Book Paratext. In Daniel Stein & Jan-Noël Thon (eds.), *From Comic Strips to Graphic Novels. Contributions to the Theory and History of Graphic Narrative* (= Narratologia. 37), 155–189. Berlin & Boston: Walter de Gruyter.